CIPP Model Approach to School-Based Management Program Evaluation

Musifuddin¹, Dukha Yunitasari², Hary Murcahyanto³
Universitas Hamzanwadi, Selong Lombok Indonesia
e-mail Correspondent: musiffuddin@gmail.com

Received: 11-12-2023 Revised: 13-01-2024 Accepted: 06-03-2024

Abstract

This study is an evaluative study using the CIPP model to evaluate the effectiveness of implementing the School-based Management program at the 1 Sukasada State High School. The subjects involved 70 respondents, including the head of the school, teachers, entrepreneurs, students, and school committees. Data processing is performed in a descriptive quantitative manner with simple statistical analysis and tabulation, following the National Department of Education standards. The results showed a context component score of 2,973, an input of 3,604, a process of 2,892, and a product (output and outcomes) of 2,495. The results of the observations show that the conditions of the community and the potential of the area are very supportive of the development of schools. However, of the 483 alumni, only 230 (46.75%) were traceable, with 27.39% working according to competence and 20.87% continuing education. Low output quality is affected by the efficiency of processes, contexts, and inputs, resulting in low school performance efficiency scores. Thus, the effectiveness of the implementation of School-based Management in the State High School 1 Sukasada was assessed as unsatisfactory. It is recommended that managers improve planning, consider market needs, and improve the effectiveness of implementation and evaluation of School-Based Management programs in the school.

Keywords: School-Based Management, Graduate Quality, CIPP

Abstrak

INTRODUCTION

The Republic of Indonesia Act No. 20 of 2003 Section II Section 3 stipulates that national education has a strategic role in developing capabilities, shaping character, and raising the nation's civilization with a view to enlightening life. This education aims to develop the potential of students to be believing individuals, fearful of the one God, noble, knowledgeable, speaking, creative, independent, as well as democratic and responsible citizens (Inkiriwang, 2020; Muhdi, 2019; Rahman, Naldi, Arifin, & R, 2021). Since the 1997 reforms, fundamental changes have occurred in national and national life, including in the field of education. Law No. 22 of 1999 on Regional Autonomy and Law No. 25 on the financial balance between the center and the district give the authority to the districts to regulate their own houses, changing the system of government management from centralistic to decentralistic (Muyassarah, Ghofur, Murtadho, Mohamad, & Mansur, 2023; Nababan & Shahrullah, 2021; Nasrum, 2013). The implications of such a change in education are the school's autonomy, giving the school the authority to improve the quality of education. The Law No. 20 of 2003 on the National Education System, known as School-Based Management, became the legal umbrella for this autonomy. The principle of education in this law emphasizes the participation of all components of society in the quality control of educational services (Sakawati, Widyawati, Sulmiah, & Saleh, 2023; Tafonao, 2022).

Despite the government's efforts, the quality of education in Indonesia is still considered low compared to neighboring countries. This fact raises highlighting and criticism, as reflected in the UN's Human Development Index, which places Indonesia's quality of human resources at number 109 out of 174 countries. The government is trying to address this problem through policy, including the introduction of the secondary education system in 1994/1995 (Fuady, Fuady, & Aulia, 2022; Leon-Castro, Blanco-Mesa, Romero-Serrano, & Velázquez-Cazares, 2021; Palamim, Boschiero, Valentíse, & Marson, 2022; Setiawan & Ariani, 2022). School-based Management Studies in some countries show that the active participation of students' parents can be increased through school-based management (Dasopang & Pohan, 2022; Guha, 2021; Khanal & Guha, 2023). Nevertheless, the implementation of School-based Management in Indonesia still faces constraints, such as minimum understanding among educational officials. Studies in various regions of Indonesia show that School Based Management can effectively improve various components in education, depending on the readiness and commitment of school managers (Bafadal, Wiyono, & Sobri, 2019; Lestari, Anggraini, & Maisyaroh, 2021; Sulaeman, 2019).

The poor quality of education in Indonesia is due to a factor that drives teachers to find additional jobs because of insufficient school income. Nevertheless, this should not be an excuse for ignoring the basic tasks of school. A school-based management system in secondary schools can improve the well-being of teachers without leaving their core duties (Sihombing & Samosir, 2021; Yusuf, Amzat, & Saidin, 2019). The poor quality of education in Indonesia is due to poor management of education, inadequate policies, poor resolution of educational problems, and project orientation resulting in disappointing educational outcomes (Jansa, Fitria, & Wahidy, 2021; Kurniawati, Arafat, & Puspita, 2020; Patras, Iqbal, Papat, & Rahman, 2019). In the Law No. 20 of 2003 on national education, the public has a role to play in improving the quality of education services through educational councils and school committees. School-based management gives autonomy at the school level and teachers to organize education according to the school's objectives (Inkiriwang, 2020; Murharyana, Ayyubi, Rohmatulloh, & Suryana, 2023). Three concepts of School-based Management: management as resource coordination, school-based autonomy, and involvement of interest groups. Implementation involves self-evaluation,
identification of needs, formulation of vision objectives, programming, implementation, and evaluation. Public involvement supports education, and general regulation is needed for the implementation of School-based Management (A. Fauzi & Masrupah, 2024; F. Fauzi, 2019; Nisa, 2022; Pujiastuti, 2021).

In the context of School-based Management, there is a dividing gap between schools, parents, and society. The participation of parents and the community is crucial in the management of education in schools. Parental involvement has advantages, such as better academic and cognitive development of students. In School-based Management, a reform of the relationship between schools, parents, and society is required, where responsibility for education is not just the school, but all parties (Agus, Juliadharma, & Djamaluddin, 2023; Ayyusufi, Anshori, & Muthoifin, 2022; Berhanu, 2023; Mohzana & Murcahyanto, 2023; Sirait, Siabat, Napitupulu, Simanjuntak, & Purba, 2022; Wardiyah, Budianti, Farabi, & Sirojuddin, 2023). School-Based Management considers context, input, process, and product as an integrated system to improve the quality of education. Quality is measured in both absolute and relative terms, involving internal and external clients. School-based management focuses on improving the quality of graduates to cope with the age of globalization. The quality of the graduate measures the objectives of vocational education, focusing on curricula that cover normative, adaptive, and productive subjects (Aturupane, Glewwe, Utsumi, Wisniewski, & Shojo, 2022; Hardiansyah, 2022; Rohma, Harapan, & Wardiah, 2020; Tasar, 2018; Yatri, Fatayan, & Granatuma, 2022).

However, the 1st Sukasada State High School, for example, faces various challenges. Despite its modern potential and facilities, the number of students enrolled continues to decrease, becoming a concern because the High School of Education should be an asset of development in the tourist destination area such as Buleleng, Bali. Therefore, the study aims to evaluate the implementation of the School Based Management program at the High School of Education of the State 1 Sukasada. The study uses the CIPP model (Context, Input, Process, Product) to analyze the educational problems at the 1 Sukasada State High School. The context involves legal foundations and public support. Inputs include human resources and supplies. The educational process should focus on the development of pupils. Products are evaluated from student achievement with an emphasis on outcome.

This research includes an evaluation of the implementation of a School-based Management program at the 1 Sukasada State High School. Identifying problems includes skills programmes that don’t fit the needs of the business world, minimum school promotion, and other constraints. The study also aims to provide policy recommendations to improve the quality of implementation of School-based Management in the school.

**METHOD**

This study adopted a qualitative research design approach (Ngala, Fongod, Orock, Ayuk, & Njenwi, 2019). Evaluation of Implementation of School-based Management Programs carried out at Sukasada State High School 1 is methodological research that can be classified into the type of evaluative research because the analysis carried out based on the management-oriented evaluation approach of the program is a duty to know the description of the procedures and process of implementation of the program following the standards that have been established by the Ministry of Education. The type of evaluation is a formative evaluation using the CIPP model. (context,input, process, product) (Zhang et al., 2011).
The study involved all the students of Sukasada State High School 1, including the head of school, staff, teachers, business officials, students, school committee members, and other related parties such as the business and industry. The population, especially the teachers and staff, did not involve sampling but were all subject to research. The research subjects included the head of the school, all the teachers, and the enterprise, with a total of 60 people as primary data through the questionnaire. For student groups, student parents, and stakeholders, samples are determined using purposive sampling techniques, and adjusted to information development until generalized repetition occurs.

Because student groups, student parents, and stakeholders act as control groups, the number of samples is adjusted to information developments until generalized repetition occurs. The nature of a group of research subjects that cannot be generalized causes the provision of research instruments to be adapted to the group of each subject. School leaders, teachers' groups, and officials are generalizable subjects, while student groups, students' parents/school committees, and stakeholders are subject to scandals by obtaining data through interviews.

In this study, several methods of data collection were used, namely interviews, observations, documentation, and questionnaires. Interviews were conducted in a structured and unstructured manner with informants considered peers to obtain comprehensive data. Observation involves the systematic recording of physical symptoms in specific social situations. The documentation method uses internal official documents such as memos, announcements, instructions, agency rules, minutes of meetings, and leadership decision reports. The questionnaires are used on groups of heads of schools, teachers, and entrepreneurs with closed questions, while students, parents of students, and stakeholders are interviewed. The research instrument refers to the evaluation tool of the Department of National Education, tailored to research needs, with expert consultation of research methods. The validity of the instrument is considered guaranteed because it is partly a tested raw instrument.

In this evaluative study, data collection instruments are obtained through methods of interviews, observations, questionnaires, and documentation. Assessment instruments are structured based on key components to measure the effectiveness of the implementation of the School-based Management Program with the components Context, Input, Process, and Product (Output and Outcome). Each component has several aspects and each aspect consists of several indicators, with each contributing differently to the effectiveness of the program. The data analysis is carried out by dividing the data into two groups, namely primary data obtained directly from the field through questionnaires, interviews, and observations, as well as secondary data which is an official document of the relevant authorities. The data processing process involves triangulation, tabulation of data according to its properties, and calculation of the level of efficiency and quality of each component. Scores and values are given to indicators and sub-indicators based on quality, quantity, and program execution, with the depreciation of the components specified.

HASIL DAN PEMBAHASAN
RESULT
Context Component

Based on the tabulation of the results of the evaluation of the research respondents (Head of School, Teacher, and Enterprise) through the questionnaire instrument, then obtained indicator value, aspect value, component value and component effectiveness value. Summarize the calculation of the background component as shown in this table.
Table 1. Summary of the Results of the Calculation of the Value of the Background Component

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numb</th>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Desc.</th>
<th>Aspect Component</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A. Natural conditions and surrounding communities</td>
<td>3,118</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B. Public demand for education</td>
<td>2,690</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>C. Public support and participation</td>
<td>2,805</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>D. Government policy</td>
<td>3,328</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>E. Public aspirations for education</td>
<td>3,197</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>F. Social and economic status of the population</td>
<td>2,705</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 1, the context component consists of the natural and environmental conditions of the surrounding communities, public demand for education, public support and participation, government policies, and the socio-economic status of the communities. The background component value of the six aspects is 2,974. The aspects of government policy obtained the highest rating, supported by documentary studies showing direct support from the education directorates and local governments in the preparation of the programs.

From the data, it is seen that the aspects of the demand of the public have the lowest value, especially in the animosity of the First High School to continue education in the State High School 1 Sukasada. It's also linked to a low student interest in entering the educational mentoring institution. Some respondents assessed that factors such as the geographical location of the school is somewhat away from the city and the inadequate means of transport affect the low interest of students. Although acknowledged by the school, it is not considered a principled factor because the surrounding area has more favorite schools.

Input Component

The entry consists of ten assessment aspects, covering vision, mission, objectives, goals, school programmes, school resources, students, curricula, independence attitudes, and finance. In the evaluation of the ten aspects the highest score was obtained on the school resource aspect with a score of 3,571, while the lowest rating was recorded in the financial aspect with the score of 2,66. Detailed values for each aspect of assessment of input components can be found in the following table:

Table 2. Summary Results of Calculation of Value of Input Components

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Numb</th>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Desc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Aspect</td>
<td>Component</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>School Vision</td>
<td>3,126</td>
<td>3,312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>School Mission</td>
<td>3,306</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>School Goals</td>
<td>3,089</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>School Target</td>
<td>2,910</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3,075</td>
<td>Enough</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 2, the input component consists of ten assessment aspects, covering vision, mission, objectives, goals, school programmes, school resources, students, curricula, independence attitudes, and finance. The highest score was obtained on the school resource aspect with a score of 3,571, while the lowest rating was recorded in the financial aspect with the score of 2,66. Detailed values for each aspect of assessment of input components can be found in the following table:
School finance, based on questionnaire data, has an aspect value of 2,694. These scores are obtained from average values of indicators/sub-indicators, including school citizens' involvement in fund excavation, funding targets, and accountability of school leaders and teachers. Additional information from interviews with 20 respondents showed that most respondents were aware of the source of school funding and the participation of school committees in fundraising. The confirmation results from the interview showed that some respondents understood the school's policies and realized that the implementation of the School-Based Management program at Sukasada State High School 1 did not rely on government aid funds.

**Process Component**

Based on the data analysis, we obtained component values of 2,873, derived from eleven aspects, namely the decision-making process, institutional management, program management, teaching-learning, evaluation, cooperation, financial accountability, independence, openness, program sustainability, and financial management.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Value Component</th>
<th>Desc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Decision-making Process</td>
<td>3,161</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Institutional Management</td>
<td>2,965</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Program Management</td>
<td>2,765</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Process Learning</td>
<td>3,052</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Evaluation Process</td>
<td>3,350</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Collaboration &amp;Participation Process</td>
<td>2,756 2,873</td>
<td>Enough</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Responsibility Process</td>
<td>2,695</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Independence Process</td>
<td>2,761</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Openness (Transparency)</td>
<td>2,535</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Program Continuity (Sustainability)</td>
<td>2,718</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Financial management</td>
<td>2,842</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the table above, the highest score was obtained on the evaluation process aspect with a score of 3.35, while the lowest score was on the openness process aspect of 2.535.

**Product Component**

The product component consists of output and outcome with 5 assessment aspects. The highest score was achieved on the academic performance aspect for output 2,899, while the lowest score was recorded on the non-academic aspect for impact (outcome) with a score of 2,361. Calculation details of the questionnaire instruments can be found in the following table.
Table 4. Summary of Product Component Value Calculation Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Aspect</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Desc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Output</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Academic</td>
<td>2,899</td>
<td>2,73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Non-Academic</td>
<td>2,561</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Dampak (impact)</td>
<td>2,710</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Academic</td>
<td>2,361</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Non-Academic</td>
<td>2,415</td>
<td>2,536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Transmission of alumni</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Since the 2010/2011 academic year, Sukasada State High School has achieved a 100% graduation rate every year. Students' learning outcomes in a productive perspective show variations in the quality of work worth selling, due to craftsmanship quality that does not meet consumer standards and product design that has not followed market developments. In terms of outcome on academic fields, by the academic year 2021/2022, Sukasada State High School has graduated 492 students. Of these, 230 alumni have been identified, with 54.78% of them already working, but only 0.32% have met the goal of the High School of Education by starting their own business and being able to employ others.

Table 5. Summary of the Component Calculation Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Num</th>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Desc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Context</td>
<td>2,973</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Input</td>
<td>3,075</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Process</td>
<td>2,873</td>
<td>2,854</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Product (Output and outcome)</td>
<td>2,495</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By combining aspect values and component values, an efficiency value of 2,850 is obtained. If compared to the classification of school performance effectiveness, this figure belongs to a sufficient qualitative category.

DISCUSSION

Context

The basic theory states that the poor quality of education cannot be blamed on just one component. School background, especially government policy, plays a significant role in promoting the implementation of the School-based Management program at the 1 Sukasada State High School. Although school autonomy has been enforced, the government's ramparts are still needed as guidelines. The location of the school in a natural and socio-cultural environment was supportive, although some respondents noted transportation difficulties. Research has shown that
graduates of Sukasada 1 State High School have access to jobs that match their skills programs, although it is worth acknowledging that low financial support from the community and students' parents can affect the implementation of the school programs. The poor economic condition of the parents of students becomes a barrier, and the lack of fund support can negatively impact the work ethos of the educational force, especially in improving the well-being of teachers perceived as low.

The poor welfare of teachers, including salaries and benefits, hurts teaching motivation and the performance of their duties at 1 Sukasada State High School. Although the teachers understand the school's financial situation, they still hope for an improvement in their well-being, in line with the demands of increasing needs. At the same time, it is important to highlight the welfare of teachers in Indonesia as a whole, where attention to teacher salaries and welfare is recognised as a key determinant in improving the quality of education. Therefore, the challenges faced by Sukasada State High School 1 are not only the academic aspects and educational programmes, but also the support of the public, the economic conditions of students, and the well-being of teachers that need to be taken into account in efforts to improve the effectiveness of the school.

It is important to formulate more holistic strategies to improve teacher well-being, such as optimizing the allocation of school funds, finding additional sources of funding, and advocating educational policies that support higher teachers' salaries and benefits. In addition, State High School 1 Sukasada needs to increase the active involvement of the community, including the parents of students, in support of the school programmes. Involving the community more effectively and providing a good understanding of the educational objectives of schools can be a first step towards creating an environment that supports the growth and quality of education in State High Schools 1 Sukasada.

**Input**

The entry component of Sukasada State High School 1 has the highest score of 3,046, which covers aspects such as vision, mission, purpose, and goals of the school, school program, school resources, students, curriculum, attitude of independence, and finance. The resource aspect of the school, including the presence of educational resources, has the highest score on the input component, indicating the school's success in managing human resources quantitatively and qualitatively.

Although school resources are valued well, there is a challenge in the quality of productive eye-catching teachers, where the training process for improving learning quality is assessed as decreasing. Improving the quality of teachers is a focus that schools need to pay attention to, especially in the face of changing curriculum demands and the labor market.

On the input component, some aspects such as finance, students, independence attitudes, and school programs get lower scores. Financial issues, especially related to the use and accountability of funds, have become major highlights requiring improvement. In addition, student aspects, enrollment animus, and extracurricular activities also need to be strengthened to increase student interest and participation.

The poor attitude of school independence indicates the need for self-evaluation and improvement in developing school-based management programs. The active involvement of the entire school community is required to create an environment that supports the growth and quality of education holistically. In the financial context, there are unclear accountability issues, causing school people to feel helpless and choose to "shut up". This creates opacity in the reporting of
programs and aid funds, which can ultimately affect the implementation of school programs. Efforts need to be made to increase transparency and accountability in school finances.

Student aspects, such as low enrollment temper and lack of extracurricular activities, require more effective promotion strategies and variation of activities outside of school hours. Involving students actively in various activities can increase their interest in the school, especially by creating interesting and relevant activities.

Process

Process components at Sukasada State High School 1 ranked third after input and context components, with a score of 2,870. The teaching-learning process became the highest aspect in this component, reaching a score of 3.40, followed by the evaluation process with a score of 3.32, and the decision-making aspect with a rating of 3.14. However, there are weaknesses in the aspects of openness (score 2.57), accountability/responsibility (score 2.57), and sustainability/sustainability (skor 2.68).

Interviews with the head of the school, school committees, teachers, and students revealed that the School-based Management program is being implemented with the awareness of the importance of improving the quality of education. However, documentation and observation data show that the drafting of the vision and mission of the school is still more influenced by the head of the school than involving the entire school community. The frequent change of headquarters also indicates a lack of commitment and a strong system to build schools.

In the history of the development of School-based Management, many developed countries have failed to improve the quality of education with traditional approaches. School-based Management Implementation should give strength to all components, including the recipients of educational services. However, at 1 Sukasada State High School, the involvement and participation of the school community in decision-making is limited, which can affect the quality of education.

It requires an understanding that for the success of the School-based Management program, quality of decision-making, leadership involving the entire school community, public involvement in the implementation of the program, and a high level of accountability and openness must be achieved. It will increase the loyalty, dedication, and sense of ownership of the school community, which in turn can improve the overall quality of education.

Product

The product components in this study are divided into two groups: output and outcome. The output group assesses student academic and non-academic achievements, including national learning outcomes, report values, levels of accuracy of productive learning outputs, and extracurricular activities. The research findings showed that the value of the overall product component was 2.73 with academic achievement as the highest aspect (2,899) and non-academic performance as the lowest aspect (2.561). In the output group, the low value of non-academic aspects was supported by the finding that student achievements in non-academic races were still limited to the district level. Extracurricular programs are available, but their performance does not always match the program. The outcome group shows a score of 2,536, with academic achievement as the highest aspect (2,71) and non-academic performance as the lowest aspect (2,361).
Sukasada State High School is still low in business and industry, reflecting the incompatibility between the input components and the educational process with the needs of the community. The low absorption capacity and permeability to the world of enterprise and industry describe that the State High School has not yet been able to create a ready-to-use workforce. Experience in developed countries such as the United States shows that the emergence of School-based Management is caused by public questions about the relevance of educational outcomes to the needs of the community. Therefore, improving the quality of education and its relevance to the needs of the community should be the focus to improve the outcome conditions of vocational schools.

CONCLUSION

Based on the previous section, the facts revealed are that the quality of output and outcomes does not meet service standards, especially in the areas of openness and accountability, apart from that, collaboration is needed to increase teacher productivity, the management system is low, the level of discipline and dedication needs to be increased again in order to increase the classroom workforce. secondary school which is the goal or vision of the school. This research can be implemented in educational institutions that have the same problem characteristics in Indonesia practically, while theoretically this research enriches the scientific treasures in the field of education and its development. However, this research is not free from several shortcomings, such as the methods used, location and research objects, so that future researchers can choose different methods to test the consistency of these findings and use research objects and locations that are larger in scope.

REFERENCES


CIPP Model Approach to School-Based Management Program Evaluation


